

Punishment versus Discipline

PUNISHMENT

Expresses power of an authority; usually causes pain to the recipient; is based upon retribution or revenge; is concerned with what happened (the past)

Is arbitrary—probably applied inconsistently and unconditionally; does not accept or acknowledge exceptions or mitigating circumstances

Is imposed by an authority (done to someone), with responsibility assumed by the one administering the punishment and the behaving individual avoiding responsibility

Closes options for the individual, who must pay for a behavior that has already occurred

As a teaching process, usually reinforces a failure identity; essentially negative and short term, without sustained personal involvement of either teacher or learner

Is characterized by open or concealed anger; is a poor model of the expectations of quality

Is easy and expedient

Focuses on strategies intended to control the learner's behavior

Rarely results in positive changes in behavior; may increase subversiveness or result in temporary suppression of behavior; at best, produces compliance

DISCIPLINE

Is based on logical or natural consequences that embody the reality of a social order (rules that one must learn and accept to function adequately and productively in society); concerned with what is happening now (the present)

Is consistent—accepts that the behaving individual is doing the best her or she can do for now

Comes from within, with responsibility assumed by the behaving individual and the behaving individual desiring responsibility; presumes that conscience is internal

Opens options for the individual, who can choose a new behavior

As a teaching process, is active and involves close, sustained, personal involvement of both teacher and learner; emphasizes developing ways to act that will result in more successful behavior

Is friendly and supportive; provides a model of quality behavior

Is difficult and time consuming

Focuses on the learner's behavior and the consequences of that behavior

Usually results in a change in behavior that is more successful, acceptable, and responsible; develops the capacity for self-evaluation of behavior

Note. Reprinted from *The School for Quality Learning: Managing the School and Classroom the Denying Way* (p.187), by D.K. Crawford, R.J. Bodine, and R. Hoglund, 1993, Champaign, IL: Research Press. Copyright 1993 by the authors.